



Project evaluation: summary report

Country: supraregional; Sector Initiative Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities

Project no.:	12.2121.7-001.00
Sectoral attribution:	Social protection
Project objective:	Official development assistance actors in Germany (notably BMZ, GIZ and KfW) explicitly and systematically take the inclusion of persons with disabilities into account in strategies, processes and programmes.
Project term:	November 2012 to December 2015
Project volume:	EUR 4.52 million
Commissioning party:	German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ)
Lead executing agency:	German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ)
Implementing organisations (in the partner country):	-
Other participating development organisations:	None
Target groups:	Persons with disabilities

Project description

General conditions

Even after six/seven years, the inclusion of persons with disabilities is still a relatively new and innovative field of work for German development cooperation. The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) provides the framework for activities in this policy field. The Federal Republic of Germany ratified this Convention in 2009. Based on Article 32 (International Cooperation), it is 'the first binding human rights convention under international law that includes a separate provision for international cooperation and development policy' (GIZ programme proposal, 2012). Respect for the rights of persons with disabilities is therefore part of the human rights guidelines for German development cooperation at the policy and strategy level.

During the predecessor project entitled "Persons with Disabilities" (September 2009 to December 2012), the lack of systematic consideration of persons with disabilities in policy strategies, processes and programmes was identified as a core problem to be addressed by the new project 'Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities'. This evaluation relates to the new project.

The sector project is part of a network of state and non-state (civil society) actors, including disabled people's organisations (DPOs) and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) active in the area of disability inclusion in Germany and/or at the international level. These include the German Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (BMAS), Christoffel-

Blindenmission (CBM), Handicap International e.V., Behinderung und Entwicklungszusammenarbeit e.V. and the VENRO 'Disability and Development' work group.

At the European level, cooperation with other bilateral partners as well as the European Commission has been stepped up in recent years. Therefore, project staff are active in a variety of fields, such as the European Commission's flagship project 'Bridging the Gap: Inclusive Policies and Services for Equal Rights of Persons with Disabilities', which is planned as part of the Global Public Goods and Challenges programme. A total of six countries are involved in preparing this project. In view of the good reputation Germany has established within the EU and its pioneering role in the field, ('...they are definitely advanced and active', EU interview partner), it is to assume the lead or chair of this project.¹ The sector project also works with the European Commission on the exchange of information and the proposed development and implementation of joint training measures in this area.

The sector project has also intensified its networking activities at the international level – for example through cooperation with the Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland (cofinancing), to provide advisory services for the African Union on implementing the African Disability Architecture and the continental plan of action for the African Decade for Persons with Disabilities. Networking is strengthened and promoted in equal measure through continuous working-level dialogue with key international stakeholders and civil society actors (e.g. UN organisations such as WHO and ILO, the Special Rapporteur on the rights of persons with disabilities, DFID and DFAT (formerly: AusAID) and the sector project's numerous contributions to international conferences and seminars.

One outcome of the sector project's work in the last three years is the increasing presence of Germany (BMZ and GIZ) at international events on inclusive development cooperation. At the same time the German Government (BMZ) has strengthened its international position as a strong and reliable partner in the field, and GIZ has offered professional advisory services in partner countries. Nonetheless, for most development assistance actors the inclusion of disabled persons is not a priority issue with established processes and monitoring. Moreover, there is a considerable degree of saturation in development cooperation with regard to new issues, especially new cross-cutting issues, which makes it more difficult to position new and complex themes and to select communication strategies, media and approaches.

Strategic approach of the project

The project focuses on four fields of activity, for which target results and indicators have been formulated. The quality of indicators 1, 2 and 4 is very good as they are specifically measurable, accepted and realistically formulated in line with the SMART criteria, as well as being time-bound. Indicator 3 (see below) largely meets the SMART criteria, with the exception of the use of the term 'successfully implemented', which is not specified.

One criterion for assessing the impact is the good position that Germany has established nationally and internationally as a leader and pioneer in this field. BMZ is now also much more active than in previous years in representing the issue of inclusion at the national and international levels, e.g. in UN processes such as the post-2015 agenda process, through regular participation in national and international conferences (some at ministerial level), the initiation of round tables and task teams, and incorporation of the theme into general development processes such as the Charter for the Future.

The project focuses on four fields of activity, for which target results and indicators have been formulated:

- (1) The sector project advises the commissioning party, BMZ, on implementing the BMZ Action Plan and anchoring the issue in the various development processes.
Anticipated result(s): The BMZ Action Plan for the Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities in German development cooperation is successfully implemented and thus contributes to more systematic consideration of the inclusion of people with disabilities in BMZ strategies and concepts. Owing to processes initiated by the Action Plan and advice provided by the sector project, the number of inclusive projects for persons with disabilities commissioned by BMZ in the context of German development cooperation is also increasing.
Indicator 1: The inclusion of persons with disabilities is incorporated into 2 additional sector concepts, 4 additional country strategies and 2 additional BMZ guidelines (baseline value 2012: 4 concepts referencing inclusion, target value: 2/4/2 see above)
- (2) The sector project advises the implementing organisations, GIZ and KfW, on the inclusion of persons with disabilities at the implementation level.
Anticipated result(s): The design and implementation of development cooperation projects are increasingly inclusive of persons with disabilities.
Indicator 2: The number of projects commissioned by BMZ (FC and TC) which address the inclusion of persons with disabilities has increased from 10 to 30. (Baseline value 2012: 10; target value: 30).
- (3) The sector project supports BMZ Division 300 in implementing Action Plan measures for which it is responsible.

¹ The final decision and approval of the project by BMZ are still pending.

Anticipated result(s): The sector project 'Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities' has advised BMZ Division 300 comprehensively, explicitly and directly on all 10 of the BMZ Action Plan measures for which Division 300 is responsible.

Indicator 3: The 10 measures for which Division 300 is responsible in the context of the BMZ Action Plan for the Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities are successfully implemented – in line with the wording of the project proposal.

- (4) The sector project develops methods and innovative, gender-sensitive approaches to the inclusion of persons with disabilities in development cooperation.

Anticipated result(s): Relevant, tried-and-tested knowledge and methods for implementing the gender-sensitive inclusion of persons with disabilities in official German development cooperation activities are available and applied in TC (technical cooperation) and FC (financial cooperation) projects. This leads to a rise in both the number and quality of disability-inclusive projects.

Indicator 4: Methodological principles to promote the gender-sensitive planning and implementation of projects for the inclusion of persons with disabilities are incorporated into 3 sector-specific guidelines for TC and FC. (Baseline value 2012: 0; target value: 3).

To achieve the above-mentioned results, the project consistently works on raising awareness among German development cooperation actors and provides advisory services and information. Within the scope of advising BMZ on implementing the BMZ Action Plan, the commissioning of a consultant for strategic development of training measures is also justified.

The key risks are a) the issue of disability inclusion is neglected in the day-to-day work of implementing organisations (GIZ and KfW) due to the high demands of cross-cutting themes; b) the issue of disability inclusion is neglected within BMZ due to it being considered an internationally unexciting and 'toothless' issue compared with politically sensitive topics such as migration. In the interviews conducted as part of the evaluation, further risks were identified, notably c) the lack of incentives and resources for additional and new inclusive measures. This reflects the boundaries and weaknesses of the system, which limit the impact of measures.

Basis for assessment of the OECD-DAC criteria:	Individual and overall rating of the OECD-DAC criteria:
<p>To determine the project's overall rating, calculate the average of the individual ratings of the five OECD-DAC criteria:</p> <p>14 – 16 points: very successful 12 – 13 points: successful 10 – 11 points: rather successful 8 – 9 points: rather unsatisfactory 6 – 7 points: unsatisfactory 4 – 5 points: very unsatisfactory</p>	<p>Relevance: 16 points - very successful Effectiveness: 13 points - successful Impact: 16 points - very successful Efficiency: 16 points - very successful Sustainability: 12 points - successful</p> <p>Overall, the project is rated very successful with a total of 14.6 out of 16 points.</p>

Relevance (Are we doing the right thing?)

Relevance relates to the handling of a core problem and aims to establish whether the project is consistent with the relevant strategies. The project endeavours to resolve a core problem, i.e. the lack of systematic mainstreaming of the needs of persons with disabilities in German development cooperation. The thematic relevance stems from the UN Convention signed by the Federal Republic of Germany, the resulting requirements at international and national level (e.g. CRPD 2015 State Report Review) and the (policy) strategy and position papers drafted by BMZ, which are also recognised at the international level. The project is consistent with relevant strategies (e.g. the BMZ Action Plan).

The relevance of the programme is rated very successful with 16 points.

Effectiveness (Will we achieve the project's objective?)

To assess effectiveness, the objectives agreed in the commission are evaluated on the basis of the indicators:

Objectives indicator	Target value according to the offer	Current status according to the project evaluation
Indicator 1	The inclusion of persons with disabilities is incorporated into 2 additional sector concepts, 4 additional country strategies and 2 additional BMZ guidelines (baseline value 2012: 4 concepts referencing inclusion, target value: 2/4/2 see above)	The topic has been included in 4 sector concepts, 10 country strategies and 2 BMZ guidelines as well as several other BMZ documents. Indicator 1 is largely achieved and, in terms of sector concepts, is exceeded.
Indicator 2	The number of projects commissioned by BMZ (FC and TC) which address the inclusion of persons with disabilities has increased from 10 to 30. (Baseline value 2012: 10; target value: 30)	35 projects address the inclusion of persons with disabilities. Indicator 2 is achieved.
Indicator 3	The 10 measures for which Division 300 is responsible in the context of the BMZ Action Plan for the Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities are successfully implemented.	13 measures were implemented. Indicator 3 is achieved.
Indicator 4	Methodological principles for the gender-sensitive planning and implementation of projects for the inclusion of persons with disabilities are incorporated into 3 sector-specific guidelines for TC and FC. (Baseline value 2012: 0; target value: 3).	A gender study was conducted, but the guidelines have not yet been developed. Indicator 4 is not achieved.

The evaluation team comes to the conclusion that objectives indicator 1 will probably be largely achieved, objectives indicator 2 will probably be fully achieved, objectives indicator 3 will probably be fully achieved and objectives indicator 4 will not be achieved by the end of the project.

The effectiveness of the project is rated **successful** with 13 points.

Overarching development results (Impact) (Are we contributing to the achievement of overarching development results?)

Impact aims to establish whether the project contributes to the achievement of overarching long-term (policy) objectives and to wide-ranging results. The project's advisory activities have made important contributions to promoting inclusiveness and the overarching long-term (policy) objectives of BMZ. The Federal Republic of Germany has established a reputation as a strong partner at the national and international level and a leader in this field. BMZ is actively committed to the inclusion of persons with disabilities at the national and international level. As a result of studies commissioned or conducted by the project (e.g. on the elimination of accessibility barriers in cooperation with KfW), further important steps have been taken towards inclusiveness and raising awareness for the target group.

The impact of the project is rated **very successful** with 16 points.

Efficiency (Are the objectives being achieved cost-effectively?)

Efficiency focuses on whether resources have been used appropriately to achieve the desired objectives. The use of personnel and financial resources is considered appropriate with regard to achieving the project objectives. Following an increase in funds, the use of resources was also adapted accordingly. The project is managed in a professional and participatory manner. The team has formulated an internal indicator which clearly shows the standard of quality expected of project management. Nevertheless, work processes require stronger and more consistent prioritisation.

The efficiency of the project is rated **very successful** with 16 points.

Sustainability (Are the positive results durable?)

When assessing sustainability, the aim is to establish whether the positive results are robust and whether the project takes into account possible risk factors which could affect the more long-term sustainability of results. At the development policy level, the BMZ Action Plan is indicative of sustainable results. Through commissioning and guidance, this also filters through to the implementing organisations (GIZ and KfW) and civil society institutions in development cooperation with varying degrees of intensity and commitment. Further indications of sustainable results include the 'ONE WORLD – Our Responsibility' Charter for the Future and the German Government's position paper on the 'post-2015 agenda', which addresses the inclusion of persons with disabilities.

The sustainability of the project is rated **successful** with 12 points.

Published by

Deutsche Gesellschaft für
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Registered offices
Bonn and Eschborn

Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 40
53113 Bonn, Germany
T +49 228 44 60 0
F +49 228 44 60 1766

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1–5
65760 Eschborn, Germany
T +49 61 96 79 0
F +49 61 96 79 1115

E info@giz.de
I www.giz.de